

ANALYSIS OF THE IMPACT OF IMPLEMENTING SCHOOL ZONING POLICIES ON INCREASING ACCESS TO EDUCATION

Loso Judijanto*

IPOSS Jakarta, Indonesia

E-mail: losojudijantobumn@gmail.com

Rhistry Frida Utami

Politeknik Stibisnis Tegal, Indonesia

E-mail: rhistry.frida@gmail.com

Dina Destari

Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Aji Muhammad Idris, Samarinda, Indonesia

E-mail: dina.destari@uinsi.ac.id

Abstract

This research analyzes the impact of implementing school zoning policies on increasing access to education. The zoning policy, adopted by the Ministry of Education and Culture, aims to reduce educational inequality and encourage equal distribution of education quality across regions. The research results show that zoning policies have succeeded in increasing equitable access to education by ensuring students can go to school near where they live. This reduces the economic burden on families and increases learning opportunities for students from various socio-economic backgrounds. Apart from that, this policy also encourages equal distribution of educational resources, including the availability of teachers and educational facilities. However, research also finds that there are a number of challenges that need to be overcome to ensure the effectiveness of zoning policies. The main challenges include disparities in the quality of teaching staff in various zones, administrative and regulatory complexities, and uneven adaptation to educational technology. The need for uniform regulation, redistribution of teachers, and improvement of technological infrastructure are the main recommendations of this research. Overall, school zoning policies have great potential to improve access and quality of education, but require continued support and collaborative efforts from various parties to overcome existing challenges and ensure effective implementation.

Keywords: Implementation, School Zoning, Access to Education

INTRODUCTION

The school zoning policy implemented by the Indonesian government in the last few years is an effort to produce a more equal distribution of access

to education. This policy aims to ensure that all children have equal opportunities to obtain quality education without being influenced by economic and social factors. By setting regional boundaries in accepting new students, it is hoped that it can minimize the social and economic segregation that often occurs in schools (Rizaldi & Hasanah, 2024).

However, the implementation of this policy is not free from various challenges and criticism. Many parents and students feel this policy is a barrier to getting into the favorite schools they want. There are concerns that this policy could reduce the quality of education due to the perception that not all schools have the same standards. Apart from that, the problem of infrastructure and the quality of educational facilities in several regions is still a challenge (Stewart et al., 2023).

To measure the real impact of this policy, it is necessary to analyze several important aspects, such as the quantity and quality of student enrollment, equal distribution of facilities, as well as increases or decreases in student achievement in various regions (Bi, 2024). This analysis is very important to find out the extent to which school zoning policies are able to improve access to education as well as identifying deficiencies that still need to be corrected. Some early studies show mixed results, some see increased access but others highlight shortcomings that need to be addressed.

This research aims to dig deeper into how the implementation of school zoning policies has an impact on increasing access to education. Through qualitative and quantitative approaches, it is hoped that more comprehensive data will be obtained regarding the effectiveness of this policy. The results of the analysis can later be used as evaluation material and recommendations for the government in improving school zoning policies in the future, to truly achieve the goal of equal distribution of quality education for all levels of society.

Apart from addressing inequality in access to education, zoning policies also aim to optimize the use of school capacity in various regions. With a zoning system, schools are expected to be able to support a proportional number of students according to existing facilities and resources (Zhou, 2023). Apart from that, this policy also targets reducing the rate of early morning departures and long trips for students, which is expected to provide more time for children to rest and study.

However, it cannot be denied that the implementation of this policy requires adjustments from various parties, including schools, parents and local governments. This adjustment includes improving the quality of education in

all schools so that there is no gap in quality between one school and another. Continuous evaluation is also needed to ensure that all schools have adequate facilities and teaching staff to support optimal teaching and learning processes (Rohman et al., 2023).

The presence of this school zoning policy also needs to be seen from a long-term perspective. In the long term, it is hoped that this policy will be able to reduce social segregation in society, where children from various economic and social backgrounds can learn in an inclusive environment. This is certainly a challenge for the government and all parties involved in the world of education to continue to improve the quality and equality of education (Amankwaah, 2024).

By understanding this background, researchers want to discuss further how the implementation of school zoning policies impacts access to education, both in positive and negative terms. Through this research, it is hoped that various important insights will emerge that can be used as consideration in making educational policy decisions in the future, in order to achieve equality and improve the quality of education in Indonesia.

RESEARCH METHOD

The study in this research is qualitative with literature. The literature study research method is a research approach that involves the analysis and synthesis of information from various literature sources that are relevant to a particular research topic. Documents taken from literature research are journals, books and references related to the discussion you want to research (Earley, M.A. 2014; Snyder, H. 2019).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Equal Access to Education

School zoning policies aim to ensure equitable access to education by distributing students more evenly across schools. In urban areas, this policy has a significant impact because there are usually striking differences in quality between schools located in the city center and the outskirts (Potapenko, 2022). With zoning, students who previously concentrated in favorite schools in the city center are now evenly distributed to various schools in the area where they live. This is expected to reduce inequality in the quality of education and improve academic achievement in general by encouraging equal distribution of educational resources, such as quality teachers and learning facilities.

On the other hand, implementing zoning policies in rural areas faces its own challenges. Infrastructure and educational facilities in rural areas are often still lagging behind compared to urban areas. In some areas, the number of available schools may still be limited so that zoning options are also limited (Gao et al., 2023). Therefore, although this policy is well-intentioned, major investment is needed in improving educational infrastructure and resources in rural areas to ensure that students in these areas receive the same quality of education as students in urban areas. The government needs to work together with various parties, including the private sector and society, to improve the quality of education in rural areas.

Overall, zoning policies have great potential to create equitable access to education, but their implementation requires careful planning and strong commitment from all stakeholders. In urban areas, zoning can help reduce pressure on favorite schools and encourage more optimal use of educational resources across schools. Meanwhile, in rural areas, the success of this policy is very dependent on improving educational facilities and resources so that students in remote areas also have the same rights in accessing quality education (Han & Kumwenda, 2024).

A crucial next step in zoning policy is to strengthen the government's commitment to improving the quality of education at all levels. One approach that can be taken is to increase training and professional development for teachers, especially those working in rural areas. Teachers' skills and knowledge greatly influence the success of the teaching and learning process, therefore, sustainable and quality training programs are very necessary. The government can also provide incentives for outstanding teachers to be placed in rural areas, so that there is equality in the quality of teaching (Laverde, 2024).

In addition, improving educational infrastructure in rural areas is an important aspect to support zoning policies. This includes building adequate school buildings, providing adequate learning facilities, and access to technology and digital teaching materials. In the digital era like now, the gap in access to technology between urban and rural areas needs to be addressed immediately. Providing good internet connectivity can help students in rural areas to access teaching materials that may not be available in their schools, as well as participate in distance learning if necessary (Magavern & Caulfield, 2022).

Collaboration between various parties is also the key to the success of zoning policies. The government, private sector and local communities must

work together to ensure that every child has access to proper education. CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) programs from companies can be directed to support the development of education in remote areas (Mia, 2022). On the other hand, the community can also be involved in various initiatives to improve and maintain educational facilities. With good cooperation, zoning policies are not just a redistribution of students, but also a collective effort to improve the quality and accessibility of education evenly throughout Indonesia.

Quality of Education

After the zoning policy was implemented, there were various views regarding changes in the quality of education, both positive and negative. On the one hand, this policy has a positive impact in the form of diversifying social classes in one learning environment. This encourages a rich exchange of experiences and views between students from different backgrounds. Schools that were previously dominated by students from higher economic backgrounds must now provide facilities and support programs for students who may need additional attention. In contrast, schools that previously lacked students with high academic potential now have students who are more diverse in terms of abilities and interests (Nabaho & Turyasingura, 2022).

However, zoning policies also bring significant challenges to the teaching workforce. Teachers in schools that initially had different educational standards had to adapt their teaching methods to meet the needs of more diverse students. Ongoing training is important to ensure that teachers have the pedagogical skills necessary to manage diverse classrooms. Unfortunately, not all regions have equal access to quality training programs, which can result in inequality in improving teacher competency. Incentives for teachers who undergo additional training and make positive contributions to the educational environment could be one solution to overcome this challenge (Harvey, 2022).

In terms of learning facilities, zoning policies highlight the inequality that exists between schools in urban and rural areas. Schools in urban areas are often better in terms of facilities and technology, while schools in rural areas still lack many basic facilities. The implementation of zoning forces local governments to evaluate and improve the infrastructure of schools that are below standard. This includes the construction of new classrooms, improvements to sports facilities, laboratories, and libraries (Haddow & Brodie, 2023). These changes require significant investment and cooperation

from various parties, but if successfully implemented, they could lead to significant improvements in the quality of education across the region, supporting the main objectives of the zoning policy.

The implementation of zoning policies also needs to be evaluated periodically to ensure that the expected goals are achieved. This monitoring and evaluation should include analysis of student performance, which involves assessing academic achievement as well as overall student well-being. Research also needs to be conducted to evaluate the effectiveness of policies in reducing educational disparities and how zoning has affected the distribution of educational resources such as textbooks, teaching aids and other teaching materials. Comprehensive data and analysis can help the government make the necessary adjustments so that this policy becomes more effective (Kumar, 2024).

The participation of the community and other stakeholders is very important in implementing zoning policies. Parents, teachers and local communities must be given space to voice their views and input. The government and educational institutions must work together to disseminate this policy in a transparent manner, while listening to complaints and aspirations from the community. Inclusive dialogue can help in creating policies that are more adaptive and responsive to society's needs (Zenkiené, 2023). Thus, zoning policy is not just an administrative regulation, but also a tool for achieving better educational equality.

Zoning policies still face various challenges, including resistance from the community who feel negative impacts, such as longer distances for students to travel or the quality of education which is felt to have decreased in several superior schools. However, there are also big opportunities that can be exploited, such as the use of technology to support distance learning for those who have difficulty accessing it, as well as collaboration with the private sector and non-governmental organizations to increase educational resources and facilities. Going forward, flexibility and sustainability in zoning policies are essential to ensure all children have equal opportunities to obtain quality education (Williams et al., 2022).

Student and Parent Participation

Student responses and adaptation to zoning policies show various dynamics. Many students initially object to being placed in a school they did not choose because of concerns about the quality of education which may be different from superior schools (Dai et al., 2024). However, over time, there

are many reports that students become more adaptable to their new environment. Especially for younger students, their ability to integrate and thrive in a variety of environments often helps them adapt more quickly. Factors such as teacher support, adequate facilities, and the availability of extracurricular activities are very helpful in this adaptation process.

Parents play an important role in the successful implementation of zoning policies. In the early stages, many parents are skeptical and concerned about the school's ability to maintain high academic standards. Some parents even try to explore ways to cheat the system so that their children can be accepted into their favorite schools, even though they are outside the designated zone. However, as the process becomes more transparent and there is intensive outreach from the authorities, many parents are starting to accept and support this policy. The level of parental compliance with the established rules tends to increase over time, especially if they see an increase in the quality of education in local schools as a result of this zoning policy (Siga & Madhakomala, 2023).

The level of compliance with zoning regulations varies greatly depending on several factors, including the level of public understanding and awareness of the long-term benefits of these policies. The biggest challenge in implementing a zoning policy is ensuring that all parties feel heard and receive sufficient explanation regarding the goals and benefits of this policy. There are also opportunities to increase compliance through supportive programs, such as providing incentives for schools that demonstrate improved performance, as well as special assistance for students and parents who experience difficulties in the transition process (Hanifah & Istikomah, 2023). With a collaborative and transparent approach, active and positive participation from students and parents can be more easily achieved, so that zoning policies can run more effectively and sustainably.

Zoning policies have several significant positive impacts on the education system as a whole. One of them is equal distribution of educational resources, which has the potential to improve the quality of education in schools that were previously considered less favorite. Thus, this policy can reduce educational gaps between schools in various regions (Gerard et al., 2022). Additionally, many schools have begun to improve their facilities and teaching quality to attract local students, ultimately contributing to improving the quality of education across the zone.

The success of zoning policies also depends greatly on the effectiveness of communication and outreach from the authorities to the

community. Intensive and transparent socialization can help reduce resistance from parents and students. The government and schools must actively hold meetings, seminars and distribute clear information about the benefits and procedures of zoning policies (Azusa, 2022). In this way, they can more easily gain support from the community. Socialization can also be used as a platform to listen to and respond to parents' concerns, so as to make this policy more adaptable and acceptable.

To support the success of zoning policies, various innovations and additional policies are needed that are able to overcome the challenges that arise. The government can consider implementing programs to improve teacher quality so that teaching standards in each school become more equal (Wang et al., 2024). In addition, it would be a good idea to develop a continuous monitoring and evaluation system to ensure that this policy goes according to plan and the initial objectives are achieved. Good cooperation between the government, schools and the community is very important to realize the big goal of this zoning policy, namely creating a fairer and more equitable education system.

Challenges and Obstacles

One of the main challenges in implementing zoning policies is the limited educational infrastructure in various regions. Facilities such as adequate classrooms, laboratories, libraries and sports facilities are often not evenly distributed across all schools. Schools located in certain zones may not have sufficient capacity to accommodate the increased number of students resulting from zoning policies. This can cause overcapacity which ultimately affects the quality of the teaching and learning process in these schools (Noonan et al., 2022). To overcome these challenges, significant investment from the government is needed in the development and improvement of educational infrastructure across the zone.

Coordination between institutions such as local governments, education offices and schools is another obstacle in implementing zoning policies. Inefficiencies in coordination often result in delays in the distribution of information and allocation of necessary resources (Nowak et al., 2023). For example, if education departments and local governments do not communicate effectively, teacher assignments and funding allocations for updating school facilities could become uneven. To overcome this obstacle, there needs to be a solid and structured coordination system between all

parties involved in zoning policy as well as a communication platform that enables the handling of issues per zone quickly and precisely.

Apart from structural and administrative challenges, response and resistance from the community are also significant obstacles. Many parents are still skeptical of zoning policies because they are worried that it will reduce the quality of education their children receive. Schools with good reputations and a history of high achievement are sought after by many parents, and zoning policies can be seen as an obstacle by limiting their choices. To overcome this resistance, more intense and educational outreach is needed from the authorities so that the public understands the aims and benefits of this zoning policy (Hartawan & Kosasih, 2023). Apart from that, there needs to be transparency in evaluating policy implementation as well as opening feedback channels to accommodate complaints and suggestions from parents and students.

Zoning policies also face challenges in terms of providing and equalizing the quality of teaching staff. Many schools in certain zones may experience a shortage of qualified teachers, especially in more remote or less developed areas. This imbalance can exacerbate disparities in education quality between schools in different zones. Teachers with high experience and competence tend to gather in favorite schools or those in urban areas (Anam & Rodiyah, 2024). To overcome this challenge, there needs to be a fair teacher redistribution program and incentives for teachers who are willing to teach in less desirable areas. Training and professional development also need to be improved to ensure every teacher has sufficient abilities to meet expected educational standards.

The implementation of zoning policies is often hampered by the complexity of administration and regulations implemented by various levels of government. Various overlapping regulations can make it difficult to execute policies effectively (Jackson, 2024). For example, different regulations between central, provincial and regional governments can cause confusion and uncertainty in policy implementation. Regulations related to new student admissions, school facility standards, and teacher placement mechanisms must be harmonized so that they are in line with zoning policy objectives. Uniforming regulations and simplifying administrative processes can help reduce these barriers and make policy implementation smoother.

Utilization of technology is another challenge in implementing zoning policies, especially in areas that are less facilitated and have limited access to digital technology. Zoning systems that require online registration and data

collection can be an obstacle in areas with minimal internet access and technological devices. In addition, not all parents and students have sufficient digital literacy to use technology-based systems effectively. Preparing adequate technological infrastructure and training programs for parents and students in using digital platforms is very important to support the success of zoning policies. This investment in technology not only increases efficiency but also ensures inclusivity in student enrollment and meeting educational needs in each zone (Caves & Cullingworth, 2023).

CONCLUSION

Implementation of school zoning policies has a significant impact on increasing access to education, but is also faced with various challenges that need to be overcome on an ongoing basis. Through this policy, the principle of justice in access to education can be realized by ensuring students have the same opportunity to go to school near where they live. This reduces inequality, increases equal distribution of education quality, and reduces the economic burden on parents. By overcoming these challenges, school zoning policies can be more effective in achieving their goals of increasing equitable and inclusive access to education for all levels of society. Collaborative efforts between governments, educational institutions, and communities are critical to ensuring the long-term success of these zoning policies.

REFERENCES

- Amankwaah, H. (2024). Fee-free education policy and the Right to Education: Ghana's Free Senior High School Programme's implementation practices in perspective. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:10:21. <https://doi.org/10.31124/advance.24784153.v1>
- Anam, K., & Rodiyah, I. (2024). Implementation of Zoning System Policies in Sidoarjo District. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.21070/ups.5280>
- Azusa, K. (2022). Do Housing Policies Enable Students in Peripheral Areas to Leave Their Parents' Homes to Go to Universities?: Focusing on "Intergenerational Homeshare Project" in Kyoto Prefecture, Japan. *E-Journal GEO*, 17(2), 363–364. <https://doi.org/10.4157/ejgeo.17.363>
- Bi, S. (2024). Catalyzing the Success of Implementation of After-School Physical Activity Program in Primary School under the "Double-Reduction" Policy. *Journal of Education and Educational Research*, 8(2), 216–221. <https://doi.org/10.54097/7pv7mf43>

- Caves, R. W., & Cullingworth, J. B. (2023). The techniques of zoning and subdivision regulations. *Planning in the USA*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39, 138–185. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003036999-9>
- Dai, T., Jiang, S., Ming, Y., & Zhang, X. (2024). The Spatial Spillover Effect of the Multi-School Zoning Policies. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4861981>
- Gao, X., Luo, J., Chen, H., Zhen, Y., Zhang, J., & Fu, X. (2023). Alleviating educational inequality in math with the aid of online shadow education– the impact of equal access and equal quality mechanisms. *Education and Information Technologies*, 29(9), 10571–10593. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-023-12214-5>
- Gerard, A., Lopez, M. C., Mason, N. M., & Bizozza, A. R. (2022). Do government zoning policies improve buyer-farmer relationships? Evidence from Rwanda’s coffee sector. *Food Policy*, 107(Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39), 102209–102209. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodpol.2021.102209>
- Haddow, C., & Brodie, J. (2023). Harnessing innovation approaches to support community and belonging in Higher Education. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:01:10, 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2023.2176907>
- Han, S. P., & Kumwenda, B. (2024). Bridging the digital divide: Promoting equal access to online learning for health professions in an unequal world. *Medical Education*, Query date: 2024-08-13 19:57:56. <https://doi.org/10.1111/medu.15455>
- Hanifah, N., & Istikomah, I. (2023). Branding of Private Schools in Facing Zoning Policies. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.21070/ups.289>
- Hartawan, R. C., & Kosasih, F. (2023). Implementation of the Van Meter and Van Horn Zoning System Policies Model. *International Journal Of Humanities Education and Social Sciences (IJHESS)*, 2(4). <https://doi.org/10.55227/ijhess.v2i4.373>
- Harvey, L. (2022). Extended Editorial: Quality in Higher Education Author Survey. *Quality in Higher Education*, 29(2), 135–164. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13538322.2022.2153642>
- Jackson, D. (2024). Inclusionary Zoning in Chicago’s North Shore Suburbs: An Analysis of Inclusionary Housing Policies in an Exclusive Market. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4815630>
- Kumar, A. G. (2024). Is ‘Quality’ a Good Quality? A Critique of Quality Perspectives in Teacher Education in Contemporary India. *Teacher Education Landscapes in India*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:01:10, 191–203. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003489245-13>

- Laverde, M. (2024). Distance to Schools and Equal Access in School Choice Systems. Query date: 2024-08-13 19:57:56. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4905690>
- Magavern, E., & Caulfield, M. (2022). Equal Access to Pharmacogenomics Testing: The Ethical Imperative for Population Wide Access in the UK NHS. Query date: 2024-08-13 19:57:56. <https://doi.org/10.22541/au.167110386.61019299/v1>
- Mia, M. (2022). Equal Access to Primary Education In Environmentally Challenged Area Of Bangladesh: A Study Into the Tanguar Haor Of Sunamganj District. *Social Science Review*, 38(1), 175–202. <https://doi.org/10.3329/ssr.v38i1.56530>
- Nabaho, L., & Turyasingura, W. (2022). Assessing and enhancing quality in higher education through the African quality rating mechanism. *Quality Assessment and Enhancement in Higher Education in Africa*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:01:10, 249–263. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003306825-19>
- Noonan, D., Richardson, L., & Sun, P. (2022). Flood Zoning Policies and Residential Housing Characteristics in Texas. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4212717>
- Nowak, A. C., Njuguna, L., & Crumpler, K. (2023). How can governments engage in adaptation tracking? A protocol for assessing national adaptation policies. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.pex-2399/v1>
- Potapenko, O. B. (2022). ACTUALIZATION OF THE ISSUE OF ENSURING EQUAL ACCESS TO QUALITY EDUCATION IN THE PEDAGOGICAL DISCOURSE. *Innovate Pedagogy*, 2(49), 9–12. <https://doi.org/10.32843/2663-6085/2022/49.2.1>
- Rizaldi, , & Hasanah, N. H. (2024). Analysis of the Implementation of the Zoning System Policy in the Service Technical Implementation Unit (UPTD) of State 2 Sungailat Private Middle School (SMP) Bangka District. *KnE Social Sciences*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:10:21. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v9i18.16345>
- Rohman, A., Putranta, H., & Sidik, F. (2023). Does the Implementation of School Zoning Policies Equalize the Quality of Education? Case Study at the Junior High School Level. *TEM Journal*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:10:21, 2593–2602. <https://doi.org/10.18421/tem124-71>
- Siga, W. D., & Madhakomala, R. (2023). Analysis of How Zoning Policies with A Focus on Achieving Equitable Access to Quality Education through New Student Enrollment Strategies. *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 6(12). <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v6-i12-67>
- Stewart, A., Sabharwal, N. S., & Yadav, R. (2023). Building an outreach culture for fairer access to higher education in Haryana, India: A ‘bottom up’ contribution to policy implementation. *Policy Futures in Education*,

- Query date: 2024-08-13 20:10:21.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/14782103231204098>
- Wang, R., Kang, W., & Fu, X. (2024). Do Inclusionary Zoning Policies Affect Local Housing Markets? An Empirical Study in the United States. Query date: 2024-08-13 20:04:39. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4909565>
- Williams, P., Sheridan, S., & Larsson, J. (2022). Quality Reconceptualized in Early Childhood Sociocultural Contexts and Quality and Quality Standards in Early Childhood Education. *Encyclopedia of Teacher Education*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:01:10, 1506–1510. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-8679-5_96
- Zenkienė, L. (2023). Joint programme quality practice in the European Higher Education Area. *Quality in Higher Education*, 30(2), 313–332. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13538322.2023.2267722>
- Zhou, C. (2023). The impacts of CCPS on Chinese education policy implementation. *Chinese Communist Party School and Its Suzhi Education*, Query date: 2024-08-13 20:10:21, 126–136. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003322047-8>